



Clubs
Oversight
Commission

**CARLETON UNIVERSITY STUDENTS' ASSOCIATION
CLUBS OVERSIGHT COMMISSION**

WRITTEN DECISION

CITATION: *in re* Gabs Jinich Fainsod v. Canadian Society for Civil Engineering
Complaint 2025 COC

JUDGEMENT RENDERED: February 12, 2025

Panel: Elnaidany, Eman, Chair; Rohacek, Aiden; Ruhl, Noah; Ahmed, Dana;
Silveira, Michael; Easby, Sam; Khalil, Anna, Doduck, Jaac

PART I. Summary

Held: The Clubs Oversight Commission found that the incidents described in the complaint reflect a culture within the Canadian Society for Civil Engineering (CSCE) that failed to adequately promote respectful and professional conduct. The Commission determined that the initial action, placing a mustache on a holiday decoration, was inappropriate. Subsequent incidents, including repeated placement of the mustache and comments on the council's Discord server, illustrated a failure to address the behavior and prevent its recurrence.

Also Held: The Commission noted that since the executives named in the complaint, Aisha Mukri and Caleb Merson, have since resigned from their positions, membership removal is no longer applicable.

Also Held: The Commission recognized that the incidents reflect the presence of discriminatory behavior within the society. The Commission recommends that both the current and incoming executive teams complete Human Rights training through Brightspace, a three-hour virtual training offered by the Equity and Inclusive Communities (EIC) office. This training covers various forms of discrimination, including antisemitism, and aims to equip CSCE leadership with the necessary tools to foster a more inclusive and respectful environment for all members.

PART II. Facts and Jurisdictional History

[1] On November 27, 2024, Caleb Merson, a first-year representative at the Canadian Society of Civil Engineers (CSCE) council, placed a mustache on the Santa decoration in the common space. This act was deemed inappropriate by members of the CSCE society and flagged for its insensitive nature.

[2] On December 2, 2024, the CSCE President was informed that an investigation was ongoing with Student Affairs. Student Affairs advised that any potential membership removals should take place the following semester.

[3] After the initial incident, a mustache was placed on the Santa decoration on two additional occasions. It is known that the mustache was placed twice more, but it is unclear who exactly carried out these subsequent actions. The continued behavior raised concerns about the CSCE leadership's failure to address and prevent such actions.

[4] Comments made by Aisha Mukri on the CSCE Discord server were considered inappropriate and discriminatory. These comments were flagged as inappropriate by the President of the CSCE on the Discord server.

[5] On January 7, 2025, Gabs Jinich Fainsod, submitted a formal complaint against the actions of Caleb Merson, Aisha Mukri, and the overall behavior displayed by the CSCE executives. The complaint cited the initial incident involving the mustache, the subsequent repeat occurrences, and antisemitic language used on the Discord server. Gabs expressed concerns over the lack of a

formal response or disciplinary action from CSCE leadership to address or prevent such behavior.

[6] On January 17, 2025, the Student Groups Administrator requested a response from the CSCE executive team and the first-year representative, which included: Austin Graham, Jake Wenman, Alex Greer, Aisha Mukri, Taytum George, Alexandra Leinman, and Caleb Merson.

[7] On January 22, 2025, Austin Graham, President of the CSCE council, along with Alexandra Leinman, sent their responses to the Student Groups Administrator regarding the complaint and the incidents mentioned.

[8] After receiving the responses, the Clubs Oversight Commission reviewed the complaint and the responses submitted by the CSCE executives. The Commission initiated an investigation into the matter to determine the extent of the actions, their impact on the society, and the adequacy of the CSCE leadership's response.

PART III. Issues

[9] The issue(s) in this case are:

- A. Was the response from the CSCE leadership to the initial incident, as well as the subsequent recurrence of the behavior, appropriate?

Per Curiam Opinion

The reasons of Elnaidany, Rohacek, Ruhl, Ahmed, Silveira, Easby, Khalil, Doduck; by THE CHAIR

PART IV. Analysis

[10] The initial incident involving Caleb Merson placing a mustache on the Santa decoration was inappropriate. While the act may appear trivial in isolation, it reflected deeper issues within the CSCE's internal culture. The recurrence of this behavior—despite its seriousness being flagged—reveals a failure to foster an environment where respect and professionalism are consistently upheld. This indicates that the issue extended beyond individual actions and points to a broader cultural problem that needs to be addressed within the society.

[11] Following the initial incident, a complaint was submitted to Student Affairs, prompting an external investigation. The university advised that any membership removal or disciplinary action be deferred until the following semester. This limitation significantly constrained the CSCE leadership's ability to respond immediately and take direct action regarding the incidents and the individuals involved. While this delay may have contributed to the perception of

inaction, it is critical to recognize that these external constraints were beyond the control of the CSCE leadership.

[12] After the investigation began, the mustache was placed on the Santa decoration two additional times. Although it remains unclear who was responsible, these repeated incidents highlight missed opportunities for the leadership to assert clearer boundaries and expectations for behavior. Internal communication and proactive steps to reinforce standards of conduct could have helped mitigate further incidents.

[13] The comments made by Aisha Mukri on the CSCE Discord server were flagged as discriminatory and inappropriate. While the president did take internal steps to identify and address these comments, no formal statement or action plan was communicated to the broader membership. This lack of transparency contributed to confusion and concern within the society about how such issues were being handled.

[14] It is clear that both individual actions and systemic cultural issues played a role in these incidents. While the leadership faced undeniable challenges due to the external investigation, there were also missed opportunities to communicate transparently and reinforce standards of respect and inclusion within the society. Addressing these systemic issues requires ongoing efforts to reshape the culture within CSCE and ensure it is consistent with CUSA's values of equity and inclusion.

PART V. Conclusion

The Commission has carefully reviewed the incidents and leadership response within the Carleton Society of Civil Engineers (CSCE). It is evident that while individual actions contributed to the incidents, these occurrences are also reflective of deeper cultural issues within the society. The external investigation limited the president's capacity to take immediate action, but there were nonetheless missed opportunities to establish clearer boundaries, improve communication, and reinforce an inclusive and respectful environment.

Given that both Aisha Mukri and Caleb Merson have since resigned from their executive positions, the Commission notes that membership removal is no longer applicable in this case. However, this does not diminish the seriousness of the incidents or the need for corrective measures. Future executive teams should prioritize fostering a culture of accountability and respect, ensuring that mechanisms are in place to address inappropriate behavior promptly and transparently.

For these reasons, the Clubs Oversight Commission recommends that both the current and incoming executive teams complete Human Rights training through Brightspace. This three-hour course, provided by the Equity and Inclusive Communities (EIC) office, covers all forms of discrimination, including antisemitism. The goal of this training is to equip CSCE leadership with the necessary knowledge and skills to foster a more inclusive, respectful, and professional

environment for all members moving forward.